MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Participants:

1.	**Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary** Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore	**Chairman**
2.	**Dr. Umar Nazir** *Assistant Professor of Plastic Surgery Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
3.	**Dr. Sana Farooq** *Senior Registrar Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
4.	**Mr. Azeem Butt** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
5.	**Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**

Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

ITEM NO. 01: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S MEZAN INTERNATIONAL (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm participated in tender and quoted instrument disinfectant Brand Name Actosed Endoterra on Tender Sr. no 5 and Hand Sanitizer M-Sept Tender Sr. no 54. The firm added that firstly it has attached Authority letter for Participation in tender and secondly, it has applied for ISO13485 that it is in process and is expected to receive Soon. Thirdly, the firm claimed that its turnover is much more than 165 million but as Tax Deduction by Govt and Armed Forces institution does not show on FBR Portal that's why it seems that the turnover is less than 165 million. Considering the sale of institution the 20% sale tax and income Tax are deducted at the stage of bill payment but it does not show on FBR Portal likewise other institutions.

Decision: Mr. Sajjad, Regional Sales Manager of M/S Mezan International pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d), (i) for all quoted items and clauses (k), (l) for T.E. 54 Compulsory

Parameters. The firm's representative presented the above-stated grievance and presented an authority letter bearing date after the date of Tender Opening. The committee also observed that the firm does not have sufficient financial capability required under section (i) of Compulsory Parameters. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 02: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S F.M HEALTHCARE (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that it has already submitted an authority letter in Technical Bid which is submitting again for perusal. The firm further stated that it has already submitted Undertaking Regarding PQCB, Blacklisting & Compliance to SRO on Stamp paper, that is submitting again. Regarding Part B to the extent of. S.No 07 Bacterial Filter for Ventilator, :the firm claimed that the Bacterial Filter which is US FDA approved manufactured on US FDA standards have proper labeling, that can be confirmed from provided samples for clarification. Regarding S.No. 72 & 73 Nebulizer Set (Adults & Peads), the firm stated that Well Lead Medical is a US FDA 510K Certified Company which shows that its products are of American standards. The firm alleged that In the technical report ordinary Chinese Brand Nebulizer Masks are Responsive & its US FDA approved product is rejected. The firm requested to re-evaluate its products as it is supplying it to many hospitals without having a single complain. Regarding S.No 116 Yanker Set, the firm stated that its US FDA Yuanker with Tube is of best quality or top Quality available at present in Pakistan. The firm claimed that its sample is specially designed that does not collapse.

<u>Grievance against M/S Usman & Co.</u>

S.No: 44,45,46,47 & 48 Foley Catheter 2 Way: The firm claimed that M/s Usman & Co has quoted Foley Catheter for the first time in any Punjab Government Hospital. In Evaluation Report there Foley Catheter are rejected in quality but no objection found in documentation that they don't have

previous experiences. The firm claimed that if they pass in quality even in that case they cannot qualify because sthey don't have past experiences of Foley Catheter in Punjab Government Hospitals, which is the basic PPRA Rule for Qualifying.

Decision: Mr. Ishaya, Sales Representative of M/S F.M. Healthcare pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d), (q), (r) & (s) of compulsory parameters for all quoted items and failure in Part-B for T.E. 7, 72, 73 & 116. The committee observed that the firm has not attached a single document with the grievance letter. The firm's representative provided an undated authority letter issued by M/S Well Lead Medical Co. Ltd. China. The firm also provided undertakings that have been issued after date of Tender Opening. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

Grievance against M/S Usman & Co.

The grievance against M/S Usman & Co. was also discussed. The committee observed that M/S Usman & Co. is already non-responsive in T.E. 44, 45, 46, 47 & 48.

ITEM NO. 03: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S LIFE-TEC (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to tender evaluation report. The firm stated that it participated for the supply of Plasmapheresis kits. The firm claimed that duly signed and stamped "Manufacturer's Authorization Letter" was attached to the bid at page 153 and has also attached a copy of the said document to grievance letter for your reference. The firm requested to re-examine its bid documents.

Decision: Mr. Ramzan, Manager of M/S Life Tec pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Part-A. The

firm's representative provided an Authorization Letter issued from M/S Sichuan Nigale Biotechnology Co. Ltd. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

ITEM NO. 04: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S B.BRAUN (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to above cited subject, and have been disqualified because of Non submission of Authority Letter of participation from Principal. The firm has claimed to attach Authority Letter and requested to allow it to participate in surgical disposable tender for year 2024-25.

Decision: Mr. Rashid, Senior Product Specialist of M/S B. Braun pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative stated that B.Braun Pakistan is wholly owned subsidiary of M/S B. Braun Medical Malaysia and does not require authorization letter as a sole agent. However, the firm has attached an authorization letter from B. Braun Pakistan in the technical bid. **The committee accepted the grievance and declared firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory parameters.**

ITEM NO. 05: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S IQBAL ENTERPRISES (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that it is sole agent of Qingdao Bright Medical Manufacturing Co. Ltd, for T.E. 22, My Heart ECG Electrodes. The firm claimed that it has been successfully supplying T.E. 22, My Heart ECG Electrodes in this institution since very long time, along with numerous other government, semi-government and private hospitals. The firm further stated that it has applied for registration in DRAP through M/s. Iqbal Enterprise.

Decision: Mr. Syed Ahmar, Field Manager of M/S Iqbal Enterprises pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) for

all quoted products and clause (m) for T.E. 96 of Compulsory Parameters, also non-responsive in T.E. 22 as the same brand has been quoted by another firm. The committee observed that the firm has not attached any document with the grievance letter. The firm's representative failed to provide an authority letter from the Principle and Notarized Free Sale Certificate for T.E. 96. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of the Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 06: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S HANSON ITERNATIONAL (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm has been declared NON-RESPONSIVE in all quoted items due to failure in Part A. The firm stated that it has been disqualified due to Authority letter for participation in tender at Mayo Hospital Lahore not attached and not sufficient Minimum Annual financial turnover for any of single financial year (i.e. during the last three financial years/ single calendar year (during the last three calendar years) must be 165 million rupees or above for local manufacture/ Sole Agent of Foreign Manufacturer. Firm will income tax return/ sale tax returns for the last three financial years/ during the last three calendar years. The firm requested to reconsider its bid and mark as responsive. The firm claimed that its product aligns with all the requirements of tender and committed to delivering high quality products to contribute to the success of this health care system.

Decision: Mr. Qasim Ali Syed, Sales Manager of M/S Hanson International pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) & (i) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative failed to provide an authorization letter required under clause (d) of compulsory parameters and also failed to display sufficient financial capability required under clause (i) of Compulsory Parameters. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

ITEM NO. 07: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S GLOBAL MARKETING SERVICES (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that M/s Global Marketing Services is an authorized Distributor of STERIS Corporation; USA in Pakistan and has been allowed to participate in all Government/ Semi Government Institutes tenders across the country for which the Letter of Authorization was attached in the Bid & specific Letter of Authorization (LOA) for participation in tender (A-12 MISC DISPOSABLE ITEMS)at Mayo Hospital, Lahore. Regarding Valid Sole Agency Agreement of quoted item for importers. the firm added that it attached valid Letter of Authorization Dated:3 January 2024 in the Bid having validity for period of 2 years and Is submitting again for consideration.

Decision: Mr. Abdur Rehman, Sales Service Engineer of M/S Global Marketing Services pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) & (j) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter established after date of Tender Opening. The firm also failed to provide valid Sole Agency Agreement. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 08: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S RELIANCE MEDICAL (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm quoted Item (123): 19% H2O2 & Silver Ions Disinfectant for Fumigation manufacturer: DIOP GmbH & Co. KG, Germany(Schutz Dental Group, GmbH) Country of Origin: Germany. The firm added that as per the technical evaluation report, the bid is considered non-responsive due to failure in Part A. The firm claimed that it has been the sole distributor of the quoted item in the Mayo Hospital Lahore, since 2016. The firm further stated that in the Technical Evaluation, its item has been technically scrutinized in the Medical Devices category which is an overlooked category as the quoted item is not a medical device (Documents attached). The quoted item is a biocide and it should be technically scrutinized in general store items or cost of other items category.

Decision: Mr. Farhan, Director of M/S Reliance Medical pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d), (i), (l), (m), (p), (q), (r) & (s) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative claimed to assess its bid under different evaluation criteria i.e General Store items. The firm attached an authorization letter established after date of Tender Opening. However, the firm provided copies of ISO 13485 and CE Certificate pertaining to Dental items. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

***ITEM NO. 09*:** **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S EASTERN MEDICAL CARE (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reservations / Clarification regarding the quoted items. Regarding Compulsory Parameter the firm claimed that the authorization letter issued by the principal (FORA) is already attached with the bid however copy of the same is again enclosed for the reference. Regarding DRAP Registration for Item # 11 & 15 the firm stated that the DRAP registrations for item No. 11 & 15 issued by DRAP is already attached with the bid and the copy of the same is again enclosed for the reference. Regarding Undertaking of Blacklisting, the firm claimed that the said undertaking is already attached with the bid and has been attached in original again for reference. The firm requested to re-evaluate the above on the same grounds.

Decision: Mr. Kamran, Managing Director of M/S Eastern Medical Care pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d) & (r) for all quoted items, and failure in clause (g) for T.E. 11 of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued by FORA Switzerland, a valid DRAP Registration License No. ELI-00130 issued on 24.05.2021 (valid for five years), and Undertaking required under clause (r). **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clauses (d) & (r) for all quoted items and clause (g) for T.E. 11.**

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

ITEM NO. 10: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S VERTEX MEDICAL (PVT.) LTD. (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to 'Not-Recommended' status in tender due to the different reasons. Regarding Compulsory Parameters the firm stated that it attached Valid Embassy attested Authorization Letter of foreign Principal manufacturer M/s Dragerwerk Germany. Furthermore, the firm claimed to have also acquired a Manufacturer Authorization Letter specially for Mayo Hospital Lahore that has also been attached with letter. The firm then stated that it has already attached Valid Drug Sale License and establishment certificate in Tag No. 04 in the submitted tender bid. Furthermore, the copies of said documents are again attached with the letter. The firm also claimed to have attached Valid ISO-13485 in Tag No. 06 in the submitted tender bid, the copies of which are again attached with letter. Furthermore, the firm also claimed to have attached Valid CE marked Quality Certificates by conformity assessment bodies notified in NANDO database (TUV) under the European directive for medical devices of EU. in Tag No. 06 in the submitted tender bid. (http://tuvsud.com/ps). For the requirement of 'experience of quoted product must be 03 years' the firm stated that it attached references in the form of Purchase orders of last three financial years in Tag No. 08 in the submitted tender bid, the copies of Purchase orders regrading T.E No. 06, 07, 57 and 87 are attached with the letter. Regarding Ordinary Parameters, the firm claimed to have quoted required face mask of its manufacturer M/s Drager Germany exactly as per tender specifications for T.E. 6. For T.E 87 the firm claimed to have quoted the required Oxygen recovery kit with bag of its manufacturer M/s Drager Germany exactly as per tender specifications.

Decision: Mr. Afridi, Sales Manager of M/S Vertex Medical (Pvt.) Ltd. pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d), (f), (k), (l) of Compulsory Parameters for all quoted items and failure in Part-B for T.E. 6, & 87. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued

after date of Tender Opening, However, the firm showed DRAP License to import Medical Devices bearing License No. ELI-00150 along with MDMC Renewal Application. The firm also provided ISO 13485 Certificate No. Q5 010578 0031 valid up to 13.01.2027 except T.E. 99. The firm also failed to provide certificates required under clause (l) of Compulsory Parameters. **The firm remains non-responsive due to failure in Part-A.**

ITEM NO. 11: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S CARDIAC CARE (PVT.) LTD. (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to the technical evaluation report having some reservations about Item nos. 01, 04, 07, 09, 10, 21, 22, 23, 28, 65, 66, 72, 73, 88, 89, 90, 91, 113, 121, 122. The firm claimed that it attached the authority letters of all principles of the item quoted in the tender to the name of the Chief Executive Officer, Mayo Hospital Lahore. Regarding Item no. 06 Anesthesia Face Mask, 12 BIPAP Mask, the firm claimed that these items are already used in different Teaching Hospitals without any complaints. Moreover, the firm clime to attach the authority letters of all principles of the item quoted in the tender to the name of the Chief Executive Officer, Mayo Hospital Lahore. The firm also claimed that both items are registered in DRAP.

Decision: Mr. Ali Aslam, Sales Executive of M/S Cardiac Care pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d) for all quoted items, failure in clause (m) for T.E. 113 & 122, failure in clause (t) for T.E. 29 and failure in Part-B for T.E. 6, 12, 29, 92 & 116. The firm's representative attached different authority letters along with the grievance letter most of which were invalid i.e. Vygon, PAHSCO, Medicath, Proactive, Ningbo Greetmed & FIAB. The firm provided an authority letter issued by Hsiner but T.E. 1, 7, 9 & 10 remained nonresponsive due to expired CE Certificate under section (l) of Compulsory Parameters in grievance submitted by M/S Sadqain Healthcare. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

ITEM NO. 12: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S INTRA HEALTH (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to quoted brand against the said item Unison is approved in Part B Sample Evaluation but not approved in compliance to Part (A) clause d. Authority letter for participation in tender at Mayo Hospital Lahore. The firm claimed that M/s Intra Health is the Sole Agent of principal Weifang Kawa Medical Products Co., Ltd China in Pakistan. The Sole Agency Letter / Authority Letter provided with the bid that is applicable all over Pakistan including private & government institutions / Hospitals. The firm also claimed that it is prequalified with DGHS Punjab for the FY 2024-25 with this authority letter.

Decision: Mr. Shehryar, Territory Manager of M/S Intra Health pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clauses (d) for all quoted items, failure in clause (n) for T.E. 7, 9, 10, 58, 61 & 62. The committee observed that the firm has submitted grievance for T.E. 8 Blood Transfusion Set only to the extent of clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued by M/S KAWA Medical Products Co. Ltd. Japan. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) for T.E. 8 only.**

ITEM NO. 13: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S TECH ZONE (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that its quoted products Sr. 71 & 98 i.e., Paper tape & Scalp vein needle have been declared non-responsive for not providing the Authority letter to participate in the tender of Mayo Hospital (clause d of compulsory criteria). The firm claimed that authority letters of all the quoted products have been provided with the bid and have again attached. The firm added that Sr. 71 i.e. Paper Tape 1" quoted brand "Yashfaeen" Paper Tape has been declared non-responsive for having the "ineffective adhesiveness" in the sample evaluation. The firm claimed that its quality product is being used in all major teaching hospital of Punjab Brand

"Yashfaeen" is being used in this institution without any complaint. The firm requested to re-evaluate the samples of tape and declare it responsive..

Decision: Mr. Amjad, Marketing Manager of M/S Tech Zone pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters and failure in Part-B for T.E. 71 & 96. The firm's representative stated that the firm has attached authorization letters in the bid at page nos. 37, 38 & 39 of Technical Bid. The committee observed that the authorization letters did not bear any date and are invalid. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 14: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S FLOWTRONIX (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to subject cited tender. The firm claimed that it has attached sole distribution letter from the manufacturer in the bid which is considered to be the authority letter. The firm then claimed to have attached a separate authority letter from the manufacturer to authorize Flowtronix to participate in this tender of Mayo Hospital and authority letter from Flowtronix designating an authorized person for this tender of Mayo Hospital. The firm then stated that item# 18,19,20 are non- responsive in part B (samples not provided). The firm argued that at the time of tender submission stocks of these products were not available. The firm alleged that an order from Mayo Hospital was also pending for supply. At the time of submission, it was mentioned in the DC that samples will be provided as stocks received and with the pending order supplies. The firm claimed that it tried to submit but the staff at store refused to receive samples. The firm requested to allow submit samples and give a fair chance in these products. The firm claimed that it is supplying these products to this institution since 2020 till to-date (an order of these items is supplied on 20th of this month).

Decision: Mr. Zarar Butt, Sales Manager of M/S Flowtronix pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters and failure in Part-B for T.E. 18, 19 & 20. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued by M/S Guangdong Baihe Medical Technology China. The firm's representative stated that the firm could not provide samples due to import issues. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters and evaluate T.E. 18, 19 & 20 from the end user.**

ITEM NO. 15: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S COTTON CRAFT (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that it participated in the above referred tender Code No. A12 for the supply of Bid Inquiry No. 93 - Plaster of Paris Bandage 15cm x 2.70Mtr but unfortunately this item has not been recommended by the Technical Evaluation Committee which is not understandable. The firm claimed that it is the last supplier for Plaster of Paris Bandage 15cm x 2.70Mtr in this institution and not a single complaint received by the department while all the formalities have also been cleared by the department. The firm further stated that it is prequalified by the Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department (PSHD), Lahore for purchase of "Surgical Dressing Items" for all District Health Authorities since 2015.

The firm also claimed that Cotton Craft (Pvt.) Ltd. is ISO certified firm from the world most accredited firms for quality maintenance of the products and environment. Cotton Craft (Pvt.) Ltd. is GMP approved manufacturer. We have well qualified / experienced technical staff in our production, The firm claimed that it manufactures its products according to the international standards of the BP/BPC and USP. and are superior in quality than the similar products of other companies / manufacturers. The firm requested to re-evaluate the samples of Plaster of Paris Bandages 15cm x 2.70Mtr. and make it responsive.

Decision:

Mr. Jamal Haider, Sales & Marketing Manager of M/S Cotton Craft pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in Part-B with the comments of TEC i.e. 'Poor Impregnation of Plaster of Paris'. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 16:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S HAKIMSONS (PVT.) LTD. (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance that all the items are Non-Responsive due to failure of Point "d" in Part-A (Compulsory Parameters). The firm claimed that being exclusive distributor it is allowed to participate in all the tenders throughout Pakistan, evidence of which was attached with the offer and on request has also received separate letter from Manufacturers to participate in Mayo Hospital, Lahore tender for the year 2024-25. Regarding T.E. No. 7 Bacteria Filter For Ventilator, the firm stated that all the details are available in the catalogue and also on package of Bacterial Filter. The firm claimed that its Bacterial Filter is used in all the major Hospitals of Pakistan and requested to re-evaluate. Regarding T.E. 12 BI PAP MASK that is Non-Responsive due to "Sample not provided". The firm stated that Samples are available and can be provided for re-evaluation. Regarding T.E. No. 37 ETT DOUBLE LUMEN 32,35,37,39 the sample of which is Non-Responsive due to "Low quality and curve is not appropriate and Suction Catheter should be provided". The firm stated that it has been supplying this sets in Nishtar Hospital, Multan, Sheikh Zayed Hospital, Rahim Yar Khan, Khyber Teaching Hospital, Peshawar and also many more Hospitals all over Pakistan and requested to re-evaluate. Regarding T.E. 72 Nebulizer Set (Adults) & T.E. No. 73 Nebulizer Set (Peads) that are Non-Responsive due to "Required a lot of pressure to form mist and No flow air". The firm stated that its Nebulizer is Registered with DRAP & the firm has been supplying its Nebulizer to this hospital and other institutions i.e. Nishtar Hospital - Multan, Sahiwal Teaching Hospital - Sahiwal, Ch. Pervaiz Elahi Institute of Cardiology - Multan, Sheikh Zayed Hospital - RY Khan,

Bahawal Victoria Hospital-Bahawalpur. The firm requested to Please re-evaluate our samples. Hopefully you will be satisfied and declare as "Responsive". Regarding T.E. 120 Urine Collector (Paeds) that are Non-Responsive due to "Sample not provided". The firm claimed that it provided Samples with the tender and may have been missed somewhere. The firm requested to re-submit the samples for evaluation.

Decision: Mr. Abid, Regional Field Manager of M/S Hakimsons (Pvt.) Ltd. pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters and failure in Part-B for T.E. 7, 12, 37, 72, 73, 120 & 121. The firm's representative provided undated authorization letters from M/S Ningbo MFLAB Medical Instrument China & M/S Atrasorb Industria De Produtos Brazil - that was not accepted. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 17: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S MEDISERVE INTERNATIONAL (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm has been declared technically non-responsive on different grounds. The firm stated that its submission did not include an authorization document specifically mentioning the name of institution. The firm stated that it is submitting an authorization document that explicitly mentions the name of institution. The firm alleged that it is also non-responsive for items No. 68, 69, and 70 without any reason. The firm claimed that the same items have been provided in the past without any issues and to declare non-responsive the same items which were qualified previous year. The firm stated that it undertakes that it will fully comply with the institution's requirements and standards. The firm requested to Review and acceptance the attached authorization document; a comprehensive review of the decision to declare firm non-responsive for items No. 68, 69, and 70; reconsideration of technical qualifications and fair evaluation of bid. The firm claimed that its bid meets the necessary technical requirements and that non-responsiveness is not justified.

Grievance against M/S Biocom International

The firm claimed that M/S Biocom International does not possess experience with the quoted products/brands. The firm added that M/S Biocom International claims a turnover of 165 million, which is unsubstantiated and requested that the turnover certificate be verified. The firm added that M/S Biocom International has an Invalid Authorization as the firm/complainant is the only authorized agent for the quoted items and have the evidence that the M/S Biocom International was rejected by the principal and has submitted a fake authorization. The firm further alleged that M/S Biocom International provided fake samples as it lacks authorization from the principal. The complainant requested that the provided samples be verified by the principal because as a sole authorized agent of the principal the complainant has provided original samples which were received by the firm through a proper channel from the principle and the samples provided by the respondent firm are bogus and fabricated with fake printing and packaging. The complainant alleged that all these illegalities were ignored and the firm was declared responsive.

Grievance against M/S Gulfam Brothers

The firm stated that M/S Gulfam Brothers does not bear 3 years' experience of the quoted product which is requirement under the bid document. The complainant showed severe apprehension about the turnover certificate that may also be verified.

Grievance against M/S 3-N Life Med

The firm claimed that M/S 3-N Life Med does not have any GMP certificate issued by DRAP for item No. 24, 25 and 26 which is compulsory requirement. Furthermore, the firm has showed apprehension about the turnover certificate.

Decision: Mr. Amir Iqbal, Sales Manager of M/S Mediserve International pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the

Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) for all quoted items, failure in clause (k), (l) for T.E. 66 of Compulsory Parameters and failure in Part-B for T.E. 24, 68, 69, 70 & 100. The firm's representative provided authorization letters issued by M/S Leboo Healthcare Products China, M/S 4L healthcare Co. Ltd. China, M/S Medbar Turkey, & M/S Medster Turkey. The firm representative stated that the TEC has disqualified the samples in Part-B due to unjustified reasons, as the TEC mentioned that the firm has not provided Canister for T.E. 68 & 69. He showed a delivery challan and claimed that the firm provided the canister as it was also mentioned on the delivery challan of sample list. **The committee decided to declare bid responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters except T.E. 116, and reevaluation of T.E. 68 & 69.**

Grievance against M/S Biocom International

The committee observed that M/S Biocom International was already non-responsive.

Grievance against M/S Gulfam Brothers

Mr. Mehmood, Marketing Manager of M/S Gulfam Brothers defended the case before the grievance committee. The complainant stated that the defendant does not qualify the requirements of clause (n) of Compulsory Parameters. The committee observed that none of the items quoted by Gulfam Brothers have more than 3 years experience that was evident from documents attached in the bid. T**he committee decided to declare all quoted items offered by M/S Gulfam Brothers non-responsive due to failure in clause (n) of Compulsory Parameters.**

Grievance against M/S 3-N Life Med

The firm's representative was absent The committee also observed that the defendant has attached expired cGMP Certificate issued on 26.10.2018 that pertained to two sections: Solutions section (dialysis solutions) & General Section (Sachet). The firm has also attached application for renewal of

previous GMP Certificate dated 5.10.2021. The firm could not provide any relevant GMP Certificate or GMP inspection report before the grievance committee. Th GMP status of the firm also could not be verified from DRAP site. **The committee decided to declare M/S 3-N LifeMed nonresponsive for all quoted items due to failure in clause (h) of Compulsory Parameters.**

ITEM NO. 18: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S SADQAIN HEALTHCARE (PVT.) LTD. (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance regarding unattached remarks for authorization letter in section d for following mentioned item numbers (TE: 1, 6, 7, 9, 10, 12, 55, 56, 57, 58, 72, 73, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, and 99). The firm alleged that the sentence written in clause d was ambiguous and after getting information, submitting the authorization letter from Intersurgical with the grievance letter. Additionally, the firm suggested to investigate the induction of the different Chinese-brand items that have been approved by institute i.e. T.E. 6 by FM Healthcare and Cardiac care, T.E. 7 by Cardiac Care, T.E. 9 by FM Healthcare and Cardiac care, T.E. 10 by FM Healthcare and Cardiac care, T.E. 56 by Biocom International, T.E. 72 by Cardiac Care, T.E. 73 by Hakimsons, T.E. 88, 89, 90 & 91 by Hakimsons, FM healthcare and Cardiac care, and T.E. 99 by Hakimsons. The firm claimed that the technical, sterile, and material quality of these products fall short of complainant's strict specifications and criteria that the complainant adhere to in order to produce top-notch goods. It further alleged that these enterprises have no prior experience or history of doing adequate business with government or private institutions. The firm further requested reconfirmation and verification of the FSC, CE, FDA and ISO of these firms. Then the firm referred to bid enquiry# 56 (ICU Kit) quoted by Biocom International as the bidder does not qualify for such item to quote because there is no authorization authentication, no required business history at all and match up with specification.

Decision: Mr. Hammad, Filed Manager and Mr. Umar, Field Manager of M/s Sadqain Health Care Pvt Ltd. pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has

disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters and failure in Part-B for T.E. 12 & 87. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued by Intersurgical Ltd. UK. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

Grievance against M/S FM Healthcare

The committee observed that M/S FM Healthcare is already non-responsive.

Grievance against M/S Cardiac Care

Mr. Ali Aslam, Sales Executive defended the grievance on behalf of M/S Cardiac Care. The committee observed that the defendant has already been non-responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters except T.E. 1, 7, 9 & 10. The complainant claimed that M/S Cardiac Care does not have valid CE certificates for T.E. 7, 9, 10, 72, 88, 89, 90 & 91. The committee observed that the defendant has attached expired EC Certificate No. 10240-2017-CE-RGC-NA-PS valid up to 12. 11.2023 in favor of Hsiner Co., Ltd.. The committee further checked the barcode the verification of which also failed. The committee observed that T.E. 72, 88, 89, 90 & 91 are already non-responsive and **decided to declare T.E. 1, 7, 9, & 10 non-responsive due to failure in clause (l) of Compulsory Parameters.**

Grievance against M/S Hakimsons

The committee observed that M/S Hakimsons is already non-responsive.

ITEM NO. 19: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S ANWAR & SONS (TENDER: A012 SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that it was not mentioned that 'Authority Letter for participation in tender of Mayo Hospital Lahore' was required by principal manufacturer, and the firm attached an authority letter to assign its representative to participate in tender. The firm claimed that the agency agreement of principal manufacturer was attached to the tender. The firm further stated that authority letter from principal manufacturer to participate in Mayo Hospital tender has been attached for the consideration.

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Decision: Mr. Khuram, Area Sales Manager of M/s Anwar & Sons pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory parameters. The firm's representative provided an authorization letter issued by Mascia Brunelli Italy. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.

Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Mr. Azeem Butt
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Sana Farooq
Senior Registrar Neurology Dept.
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Umar Nazir (Away)
Assistant Professor Plastic Surgery
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Nasir Chaudhary
HoD Ophthalmology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

AMS(P) upload As Per Rules 5/9/23